

STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD MEETING
OCTOBER 22, 2004
MICHIGAN HISTORICAL CENTER

Elisabeth Knibbe, President, called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m.

Board Members Present:

Scott Beld, Janese Chapman, Lynn Evans, Richard Harms, Elisabeth Knibbe, Carolyn Loeb, Jennifer Radcliff

Board Member Absent:

Alison (Kim) Hoagland

Staff Members Present:

Laura Ashlee, Amy Arnold, Robert Christensen, Brian Conway, Ted Grevstad-Nordbrock, Megan Melinat, Todd Walsh

Members of the Public Present:

Eric T. Alderman, concerning Portland Historic District, Portland
Jim Barnes, concerning Portland Historic District, Portland
Jane Busch, concerning Laurium Historic District, Laurium
Julie Courtney, concerning Detroit Club, Detroit
Thomas J. Dempsey, concerning Portland Historic District, Portland
Sharon Ferraro, concerning 527-31 Eleanor St., Kalamazoo
Don Flanders, concerning Portland Historic District, Portland
Marilyn Florek, concerning Cass Park Historic District, Detroit
Deborah Goldstein, concerning Palmer Park Apartment Building Historic District, Detroit
Charles Hyde, concerning Edwin Denby High School, Detroit
Gaylord Kanoyton, concerning Cass Park Historic District, Detroit
Verne Kanoyton, concerning Cass Park Historic District, Detroit
Robert Torp-Smith, concerning Portland Historic District, Portland
Gerry Torp-Smith, concerning Portland Historic District, Portland
Kathy Parsons, concerning Portland Historic District, Portland
Becky Ward, concerning Portland Historic District, Portland

Nomination of Officers

Knibbe stated she was charged with determining a slate of officers since the action taken at the last meeting was not taken in compliance with the board's constitution.

Knibbe nominated Lynn L.M. Evans, president, and Carolyn Loeb, vice-president, to take office at the conclusion of this meeting.

Chapman seconded nomination

Nominations approved 7-0

Approval of minutes of February 13, 2004:

Knibbe noted that she turned meeting over to Harms during review of the Shaffron Proposal for Decision, due to conflict of interest.

Harms noted that meeting was turned back to Knibbe with the conclusion of discussion concerning Shaffron Proposal for Decision.

Harms moved approval of minutes as corrected.

Evans seconded motion.

Approved 7-0.

Staff Reports:

Brian Conway

- Introduced Main Street architect, Megan Melinat.
- 3 new Main Street communities: Niles, Clare and Muskegon.
- Governor's Awards for Historic Preservation have been given since last review board meeting.
- Announced Mason as Michigan's newest CLG.
- 2005 Michigan Lighthouse Assistance Program applications are due November 1st.
- 2005 Certified Local Government grant applications are due December 1st.
- Amy Arnold has organized a Design Guidelines Workshop to be facilitated by Nore Winter.
- The SHPO is currently working on its next 5 year, state-wide, comprehensive historic preservation plan. The SHPO is seeking public comment/input for 5 year plan.
- SHPO staff continues to be involved in many Cool Cities activities.
- Conway was chosen by DHAL Director to head a cultural-economic development committee, whose purpose is to investigate how cultural activities impact economics, and develop a related, statewide cultural-economic development strategy.
- Legislation introduced by Senator Birkholz to amend PA-169. Legislation would remove SHPO Review Board as appeals body, and make city council the governing appeals body. Came as a result of court case in Grand Rapids concerning Uptown Cleaners. The SHPO, and preservation community as a whole, is opposed to this legislation.
- Senate Bill 1202 passed both Senate and House. This bill provides tax incentives for historic districts. This bill is a result of work done by the Land Use Leadership Council.
- Historic Economic Development Zone (HEDZ) program legislation is moving forward. Similar legislation has been introduced by Senator Jason Allen. SHPO has commented on Senator Allen's proposal and is working with Treasury on modifications.

National Register Nominations

Site: Portland Downtown Historic District, Portland, Ionia County

Presented By: Christensen

Moved for Approval: Harms

Seconded: Loeb

Vote: 7-0

Criteria: A, C

Level of Significance: Local

Knibbe questioned the appropriateness of including a parking lot within district boundaries.

Christensen replied that intent was to include of the Portland City Hall area, which includes the parking lot.

Site: Somerville Barn, Alaiedon Township, Ingham County
Presented By: Christensen
Moved for Approval: Evans
Seconded: Harms
Vote: 7-0
Criteria: A, C; exc. b
Level of Significance: Local

Radcliff asked if the barn was included in the Michigan Barn Preservation Network barn survey. Property owner, Sue Caltrider, commented that the barn has not been included at this point.

Site: Cass Park Historic District, Detroit, Wayne County
Presented By: Florek
Moved for Approval: Radcliff
Seconded: Beld
Vote: 5-0 (Knibbe and Chapman abstaining)
Criteria: A, B, C
Level of Significance: Local

Radcliff noted error in number of non-contributing resources. Should read three non-contributing resources instead of two. Florek noted letters of support from two property owners.

Site: Palmer Park Apartment Building Historic District Boundary Increase, Detroit, Wayne County
Presented By: Goldstein
Moved for Approval: Loeb
Seconded: Harms
Vote: 5-0 (Knibbe and Chapman abstaining)
Criteria: A, B, C; exc. a, g
Level of Significance: State

Goldstein noted letters of support from property owner, and from CLG commission.

Site: Edwin Denby High School, Detroit, Wayne County
Presented By: Hyde
Moved for Approval: Chapman
Seconded: Evans
Vote: 7-0
Criteria: A, C
Level of Significance: Local

Hyde noted letters of support from CLG commission.

Site: Detroit Club, Detroit, Wayne County

Presented By: Courtney
Moved for Approval: Radcliff
Seconded: Chapman
Vote: 5-1 (Beld, Knibbe abstaining)
Criteria: A, B, C
Level of Significance: State

Radcliff questioned the original level of significance (local). Christensen replied that although many significant people were associated with the Detroit Club, it did not warrant a raised level of significance. Chapman commented that consideration should be made for the political and business discussions that took place in such “men’s clubs.” Harms commented that functions of this nature took place in many similar type clubs, and that works associated with specific person should be linked to the site where the significance occurred. Knibbe commented about the political power held at such clubs. Radcliff moved for a change in status from local level of significance to state level of significance. Chapman supported this motion. Motion carried 5-2.

Site: William and Margaret Core Farm (Ruby Ellen Farm), Bingham Township, Leelanau County
Presented By: Livengood
Moved for Approval: Beld
Seconded: Loeb
Vote: 7-0
Criteria: A
Level of Significance: Local

Radcliff noted that the nomination contained some typographical errors. Christensen noted that all errors would be corrected before submission to the National Park Service. Knibbe commented that the report was phenomenal in its detail.

Site: Laurium Historic District, Laurium, Houghton County
Presented By: Busch
Moved for Approval: Evans
Seconded: Chapman
Vote: 7-0
Criteria: A, B, C; exc. a, b, f
Level of Significance: National

Appeals:

Harms moved that the approved agenda be modified so that appeals could be heard now before HDSCRs because several board members have to leave.

Chapman seconded this motion.

Motion passed 7-0

Smith v Detroit Historic District Commission
Harms moved adoption of the Proposal for Decision.
Evans seconded motion.
Vote: 7-0

Brett v East Lansing Historic District Commission
Chapman moved adoption of the Proposal for Decision.
Harms seconded motion.
Vote: 7-0

Coleman v Ypsilanti Historic District Commission
Radcliff moved adoption of the Proposal for Decision.
Loeb seconded motion.
Vote: 6-0 (Knibbe abstaining)

Conway questioned whether Brenda Rigdon was employed by Knibbe. Knibbe replied that since Rigdon is, she would abstain from vote. Knibbe commented there was not enough information present for the appeals officer to make a financial analysis (reference pages 27-28), but the appeal should still be denied.

Wheeler v Grand Rapids Historic District Commission
Evans moved adoption of the Proposal for Decision.
Harms seconded motion.
Vote: 7-0

Wilson v Detroit Historic District Commission
Loeb moved adoption of Proposal for Decision.
Evans seconded motion.
Vote: 7-0

Murray v Kalamazoo Historic District Commission
Harms moved adoption of Proposal for Decision.
Loeb seconded motion.
Vote: 6-0 (Knibbe abstaining)

Harms asked whether the board needed to respond to an exception filed by the appellant. Conway stated the exception must be acknowledged and taken into consideration. Harms stated that the claims made in the exception are not new, and were previously made in the original appeal.

Historic District Study Committee Reports:

Arnold presented reports and staff comments to the board.

Report: Hook & Ladder House No. 5 Historic District, Detroit, Wayne County
The board made no additional comment.

Report: Moross House Historic District, Detroit, Wayne County
The board made no additional comment.

Report: People's Community Church Historic District, Detroit, Wayne County
The board made no additional comment.

Report: Muskegon Boiler Works Historic District, Muskegon, Muskegon County

Knibbe asked if a new version of the report will be submitted. Arnold replied that she was going to request a new version.

Report: Starkweather Farmhouse Historic District, Ypsilanti, Washtenaw County

Knibbe asked if there was concern in the city that a separate historic district commission would have to be established for this one district. Arnold replied that even though that wouldn't be the case, that concern does exist.

Report: Merriman Farm Historic District, Washtenaw County

The board made no additional comment.

Report: Elimination of 2356 East Long Lake Road Historic District, Troy, Oakland County

Harms commented that the argument for elimination is based on the house not being at the location shown for the district on a map. Knibbe stated that a technical error is being used to question significance. Knibbe further commented that the original information applied to the building, regardless of its address.

Dates of Next Meetings:

January 14, 2005

May 20, 2005

The chair turned over the gavel to the chair-elect, Lynn L.M. Evans.

Adjournment:

Harms moved that the meeting be adjourned.

Loeb seconded.

Vote: 7-0.

The meeting adjourned at 12:45PM.

Prepared by T. Walsh